

Intertextuality as Depicted in *Beauty and The Beast* (1991) by Gary Trousdale and Kirk Wise to *Belle* (2021) by Mamoru Hosoda

Fiska Kurniansa

fiskakurnia17@gmail.com

Universitas Sains Al-Qur'an, Wonosobo, Indonesia

Latifah Dwi Ariyani

latifah@unsiq.ac.id

Universitas Sains Al-Qur'an, Wonosobo, Indonesia

Abstract

*The study aimed to analyze the types of intertextuality shown in *Beauty and the Beast* (1991) to *Belle* (2021) by Gary Trousdale and Kirk Wise to *Belle* (2021) by Mamoru Hosoda, and the representation of Kristeva's intertextuality theory utilizing genotext and phenotext. The study uses the descriptive qualitative method to analyze the films *Beauty and the Beast* (1991) by Gary Trousdale and Kirk Wise and *Belle* (2021) by Mamoru Hosoda as the objective of the research. The procedure of collecting the data is watching and reading, identifying, classifying, and selecting. The procedure of analyzing the data uses Spradley's content analysis approach, with four deep stages: Domain analysis, taxonomy analysis, componential table, and cultural theme. The researcher analyzed the data by using Kristeva's intertextuality and Fitzsimmons's types of intertextuality. The result of the study: the types of intertextuality found in *Beauty and the Beast* (1991) by Gary Trousdale and Kirk Wise and *Belle* (2021) by Mamoru Hosoda are optional intertextuality, obligatory intertextuality, and accidental intertextuality. The most common type of intertextuality is optional intertextuality. Phenotext and genotext representations in both films are found in several characters in both films. Phenotext in utterances and scenes. Meanwhile, speech intonation and visual expressions that represent several characters as a mode of psychological response are elements of the genotext.*

Keywords: *Intertextuality, types of intertextuality, phenotext, and genotext*

Introduction

Literary works have been created from the writer's ideas. The ideas of literary works always revolve and they can be inspired by other literary works. Many literary works are built from the same theme, social background, or tradition as previous literary works. Every reader who reads the text must engage in the meaning-making process to assess the significance of the text they have read.

Without realizing it, the code and significance in the text were obtained from texts that had been read before. No single text can be considered completely independent, despite what some people may think. To gain relevance, every existing text is always connected to other texts. So, similarities are commonly found in some works. The interconnection that occurs in similar literary works can be stated as intertextuality.

Kristeva (1960), stated that no text is truly original or unique, according to the idea that intertextual relationships may be discovered in various literary genres and that different texts exist through their relationship to earlier literary texts. According to the concept of intertextuality, everything incorporates or borrows in some pattern from earlier literary works. Every word is related to another word, no word stands alone. Intertextuality is not just between written and non-written literary works but is also seen in films.

According to Allen in his book *Intertextuality: The New Critical Idiom* (p. 174: 2000), intertextuality is a term that can be used in talks of other subjects besides literature. It appears in discussions of almost every form of artistic and cultural creation, including film, painting, music, architecture, and photography. However, to understand the use of intertextuality in the study of non-literary art forms, we only need to recognize the relationship between the early expressions of intertextual theory and the development of Saussure's notions of semiology. This correlation, in addition to the obvious one between literature and the word "text," is important.

The researcher suggests that intertextuality is a relevant approach to use in analyzing the two literary works. *Beauty and the Beast* (1991) and *Belle* (2021) are literary works that were written in different eras. *Belle* (2021) was released in the modern era, while *Beauty and the Beast* (1991) written released in the Disney Renaissance era. Each literary work focuses on a similar theme and characters, but there are some parts in the story. In order to learn more about the connections between *Belle* (2021) and *Beauty and the Beast* (1991), the researcher will analyze the two literary works using the intertextuality theory approach.

Literary Review

Intertextuality

According to Fitzsimmons (2013), intertextuality can occur between texts along with between texts and other works of literature including music, films, television programs, and poetry. Intertextuality is the process of modifying one text's meaning and implementing it into another. Intertextuality is the representation of an existing story from a new point of view within an integrated conceptual framework.

Depending to Fatmasari, Y., & Ariyani (2022), the notion of intertextuality as the receptor's reading process will lead him from only a reader to an author or producer of new works of literature. Therefore, the author might make a work based on previously seen or read works. The reader's reaction to a literary work has no limit to the text's interpretation or meaning. Readers can contribute to the text's meaning and relevance by drawing on their own consciousness, perception, and experience.

Theory of Intertextuality

Kristeva a French researcher, popularized the thesis of intertextuality in the late 1960s, and it is this concept that underlies the concerns of structuralist poststructuralists. It combines Bakhtin's theory of the social context of language or dialogism with Saussure's perspective on the structural characteristics of language. An analysis of the various interpretations that each text and word could have. According to Kristeva's concept of intertextuality, the text should be viewed as a dynamic context where relational practices and processes, rather than static structures and products, should be the subject of analysis. Kristeva contends that authors construct their works from already existing ones rather than starting from zero.

Alfaro (1996) stated that every word contains other words, and every text contains other texts. Because texts are affected by the repetition and transformation of other textual structures, the concept of intertextuality requires that we see texts not as self-contained systems but rather as varied and historical, as traces and tracings of alienation. The theory of intertextuality asserts that a text

cannot exist as a self-sufficient whole and, therefore, that it does not operate as a closed system, rejecting the New Critical notion of textual autonomy.

Phenotext and Genotext

Kristeva created the phrases "phenotext" and "genotext" to describe the distinct nature of this text. The phenotext, on the other side, is composed of components that are connected to the symbolic mode of language, that is, elements that depend on language, presentation, and logic through an attempt to express meaning. A "genotext" is a literary element that creates a semiotic mode's psychological response, such as feelings of love, hopelessness, alienation, or other emotions. According to (Allen, 2000: p. 50) in (Kristeva, 1984a: 86) The 'phenotext' is that part of the text bound up with the language of communication, the 'thetic-thesis', which displays definable structure and appears to present the voice of a singular, unified subject (1984a: 87). The "genotext" is the component of the text that develops from the unconscious "driving energy" and can be recognized by "phonematic resources" such as rhythm and intonation, melody, repetition, and even narrative structure types. Genotext is the driving energy behind the language. The driving energy, or the subconscious, can be detected in the tone, gestures, and expressions made outside of the actual words. It is simply Phenotext, what of it. and genotext is why of it.

Types of Intertextuality

There are three categories of intertextuality and intertextual relationships based on (Fitzsimmons, 2013): optional, obligatory, and accidental.

1. Optional Intertextuality

Optional intertextuality has a less significant effect on the importance of hypertext. It is a potential—but not necessary—intertextual relationship that, if noticed, might significantly change how readers interpret the text. Optional intertextuality occurs when a text is in some way hypotext towards its hypertext, and it is up to the author to create a link between the two texts.

2. Obligatory Intertextuality

Obligatory intertextuality happens when one data has similarities in both media or when the data in both media is different, resulting in a comparison of one data.

3. Accidental Intertextuality

Accidental intertextuality occurs when there is data contained in two distinct media that have no connection at all or are accidentally related to other sources or data that are not related at all.

Research Methodology

The qualitative research method was chosen by the researcher for this research because this method merely gathers and organizes, and interprets data to create results without using a generalization. The literary work and scripts or subtitles and scenes in *Beauty and the Beast (1991)* by Gary Trousdale and Kirk Wise with a duration of 139 minutes and available in Disney Plus Hotstar and *Belle (2021)* by Mamoru Hosoda with a duration of 136 minutes also available on Netflix, serve as the object of supporting data as well as the source of data for the study. the researcher used several steps to collect data with watching and reading, identifying, classifying, and lastly is selecting.

The researcher employs Spradley's (1980) content analysis approach to analyzing the data. According to Spradley (1980), there are four deep stages of analyzing data in qualitative research: Domain, Taxonomy analysis, Component analysis, and Cultural Theme.

Findings and Discussion

This chapter presents the findings of the analysis and discussion based on the research problems. The researcher is going to discuss the results based on the types of intertextuality and analysis of genotext and phenotext in the films *Beauty and the Beast (1991)* by Gary Trousdale and Kirk Wise and *Belle (2021)* by Mamoru Hosoda.

Types of Intertextuality Found in the Film *Beauty and the Beast (1991)* and *Belle (2021)*

1. Optional Intertextuality

Optional intertextuality occurs when any data exists in both media or when just one piece of data appears in one of the media, either one of the films or both films.

Optional intertextuality shows up in the physical characteristics of Belle in *Beauty and the Beast* (1991) between Belle (Suzu) when she is in the virtual app world, U. This suggests that *Beauty and the Beast* (1991) and *Belle* (2021) bear no physical similarity.



<i>Beauty and the Beast</i> (1991)	<i>Belle</i> (2021)
 <p data-bbox="384 848 759 922">(Beauty and the Beast, 1991, 00.04.06)</p>	 <p data-bbox="967 853 1267 887">(Belle, 2021, 00.17.58)</p>

Figure 4. 1 Belle’s first appearance in *Beauty and the Beast* and Belle (Suzu) in the first appearance in *Belle*

Beauty and the Beast (1991) Belle has fair skin, a beautiful face, long brown hair, usually tied back in a low ponytail with a blue ribbon, and brown eyes, full lips, flushed cheeks, and a beautiful figure. *Belle* (2021) The belle in the virtual world U has a beautiful face, long pink hair, blue eyes, has freckles on her face, and wears a beautiful dress. (*Belle*, 2021, 00.17.43)

Optional intertextuality happens when Belle in both of films has a different visualization. Disney's animated version of Belle represents Belle as the primary character with every characteristic attached to her, which includes brown hair, a blue ribbon, then at the end of the story with a bright yellow dress that appears to be one of her trademarks. Mamoru Hosoda's Belle which is the avatar of Suzu in the virtual world of U resembles a classic studio princess, with a waifish face and enormous blue eyes. Suzu, on the other hand, has the appearance of a classic anime cartoon heroine. So, the optional intertextuality occurs because Mamoru Hosoda made Belle quite different from the Disney animated version of Belle, even though both were made by Disney animators. The director depicts Belle (Suzu) in a typical Japanese anime cartoon form.

2. Obligatory Intertextuality

Obligatory intertextuality happens if one data has similarities in both media or when one piece of data is distinct in both media, leading to a comparison of one data.



<i>Beauty and the Beast</i> (1991)	<i>Belle</i> (2021)
 <p data-bbox="355 734 778 808">(Beauty and the Beast, 1991, 00. 21.49)</p>	 <p data-bbox="943 712 1254 748">(Belle, 2021, 00. 44.44)</p>

Figure 4. 2 Setting’s the Castle in Beauty and the Beast (1991) and Belle (2021)

The castles in the films *Beauty and the Beast* (1991) and *Belle* (2021) have the same feature. Although the castles are located on different worlds, the castle in *Belle* (2021) is located in a world of U. In the film *Beauty and the Beast* (1991), Belle finds out the Beast's castle because her father is being prisoned. She discovers Philippe, her father's horse, alone, and follows the direction Philippe is pointing, she comes to Dragon's castle, which appears frightening from the outside. In the film *Belle* (2021), Belle was looking for Dragon suddenly an AI angel appeared to lead her to a castle, which turned out to be Dragon's castle. The castles in *Beauty and the Beast* (1991) and *Belle* (2021) are structurally similar. The first door opens showing a grand stairway with two wings, the west and east wings. There are big statues and a large hallway filled of paintings, and also a large round staircase.

Obligatory intertextuality appears because the Dragon's castle in *Belle* (2021) is visually similar to the Beast's castle in *Beauty and the Beast* (1991). *Belle* (2021) director shows an enormous castle, grand staircases, and large statues that all appear terrifying when Belle enters it.

3. Accidental Intertextuality

Accidental intertextuality happens when there is data contained in different media that have no connection at all or are accidentally related to other sources or data that have no connection at all.

Accidental/Character/Belle’s other similarity

The researcher found another similarity between Belle (Suzu) is a character who, like Hana from *Wolf Children* (2016), must deal with a deep feeling of loss and seek support from those around her in a story distinguished by grief as much as love and optimism. Belle (Suzu) mourns the death of her mother when she was young, but she gradually develops and grows brighter even saving Kei, the character of Dragon, and her younger brother from their abusive father.

The Representation of Phenotext and Genotext in the Films *Beauty and the Beast* (1991) by Gary Trousdale and Kirk Wise and *Belle* (2021) by Mamoru Hosoda

The researcher uses the theory of intertextuality and semiotics to analyze the phenotext and genotex in both the film *Beauty and the Beast* (1991) and *Belle* (2021). Phenotext is similar to symbolic and refers to the conscious ways that people and verbal systems use to say things. Genotext is similar to semiotics, which refers to the unconscious ways in which people utilize gestures, intonation, emotion or expressions for understanding their words.

<i>Beauty and the Beast</i> (1991)	<i>Belle</i> (2021)
Dialogue 1	Dialogue 2
<p>BELLE: No! Wait! Forgive me. Please, let him out. Can't you see he's not well?</p> <p>BEAST: Then he should not have trespassed here.</p> <p>BELLE: But he's an old man. He could die!</p> <p>BEAST: There's nothing you can do!</p> <p>BELLE: Wait, please... take me instead!</p> <p>MAURICE: No! Belle, you don't know what you're doing.</p> <p>BEAST: You would do that? You would take his place (<i>Beauty and the Beast</i>, 1991, 00.22.23-00.24.28)</p>	<p>BELLE: Secret roses? Why keep them a secret?</p> <p>DRAGON: What are you doing here? [growling] You are trespassing!</p> <p>BELLE: No, I followed the angel.</p> <p>DRAGON: Then get out.</p> <p>BELLE: But...</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">Dragon: [growling] Get out now!</p> <p>BELLE: Hold on. I came here because I wanted to ask you something. Who are you really?</p> <p>(<i>Belle</i>, 2021, 00.43.32)</p>

Table Dialogue 1 and 2

Phenotext elements because the dialogue shows that Belle really loves her father, so she is willing to find and replace her father in prison as a prisoner of the Beast. When Belle sees her father imprisoned and sacrifices herself, she has a sad expression on her face. The researcher views Belle's sorrowful and teary act as phenotext because she saw her father's imprisonment. Meanwhile, the genotext element is seen in Belle's replacement of her father. That is from the Beast, who agreed to Belle replacing her father, causing a driving energy that caused Belle to cry sadly and separate from her father. The utterances "*Then he should not have trespassed here!*" and "*You are trespassing!*" in both films show genotext elements, Beast said "*Then he should not have trespassed here.*" as a form of reply from Belle when asking for her father to be driven out, then with a sarcastic intonation Beast said this, which means that if Belle's father did not trespass into Beast's castle, then he would not be imprisoned. Secondly, the utterance "*You are trespassing*" that Dragon said to Belle, because Belle entered his castle. He raised his intonation from medium to high and growled fiercely since he felt Belle was bothering him.

<i>Beauty and the Beast</i> (1991)	<i>Belle</i> (2021)
Dialogue 1	Dialogue 2
BEAST: Don't touch that! BELLE: I'm sorry! BEAST: What are you doing here? BELLE: I— BEAST: I told you never to come here! BELLE: I know but— BEAST: Do you realize what you could have done? Get out! (<i>Beauty and the Beast</i> , 1991, 00.46.13-00.46.20)	BELLE: Bruises. DRAGON: Get away! Don't touch me! BELLE: I'm sorry, but your bruises... they're... DRAGON: You think they're ugly? Is that it? BELLE: No! Are they painful? I'm sure they are. I just... DRAGON: You have no clue about anything! BELLE: Then why don't you explain it to me? DRAGON: [growls] Get out of here! (<i>Belle</i> , 2021, 00.56.04-00.56.25)

Table Dialogue 1 and 2

The conversation between Belle and Beast, and also the conversation between Belle (Suzu) and Dragon, is phenotext. The way the Beast and Dragon speak to Belle and Belle (Suzu) is a phenotext because the things they hide are seen by others. The genotext can also be found in the two dialogues. The genotext

elements are reflected in the utterances *"Don't touch that!"* by the Beast and *"Get away!"* by the Dragon. Beast said in a low but intimidating tone to Belle. *"Do you realize what you could have done?"* he asks. Beast also breaks the table as a symbol of his madness, further frightening Belle. And at the phrase *"Get out!"* that was spoken in a very high tone and a growl made Belle run from the Beast's room in fear. The genotext element is also seen in Dragon's conversation when Belle (Suzu) touches the bruises causing Dragon to become defensive towards Belle. The statement, *"You think they're ugly?"* which Dragon said was a sign of anger and sarcasm because Belle saw the bruises. But the response from Belle (Suzu) made him angry, and with a growl and a very high-pitched intonation, he finally scared Belle (Suzu) and left the castle.



(*Beauty and the Beast*, 1991, 00.58.11-01.00.16) (*Belle*, 2021, 01.01.06-01.02.38)

Figures 4.17–4.19 represent the phenotext element in which the Beast offers Belle to dance with him. It's considered a phenotext because Beast said it gently and uncomplicatedly. From the bottom of his heart, he wanted Belle to accept him. Beast was relieved and delighted when Belle accepted it with a smile. The

genotext element is when the Beast holds Belle's hand, and with a soft gaze, dances with Belle, he treats Belle carefully. Other genotext elements can be seen in the pleasant facial expressions of the Beast and Belle.

Phenotext elements include Belle (Suzu) telling Dragon about the bruises Dragon feels and thanking Dragon for safeguarding Belle (Suzu) from the Justices' chase. the genotext element is shown when Belle reaches out her hand to invite Dragon to dance. Other genotext elements show in Belle's (Suzu's) and Dragon's emotions of gladness. Belle (Suzu) is pleased since Dragon has not refused or become defensive of her, while Dragon is pleased because he believes he needs Belle (Suzu). Both scenes of the films have in prevalent to create intertextuality.

The fourth data is Gaston's arrogance in the film *Beauty and the Beast* (1991) and Justin's arrogance in the film *Belle* (2021). The scene and conversation below show the phenotext and genotext:

<i>Beauty and the Beast</i> (1991)	<i>Belle</i> (2021)
<p>Dialogue 1</p> <p>GASTON: If I didn't know better, I'd say you have feelings for this monster.</p> <p>BELLE: He's not the monster, Gaston! You are!</p> <p>GASTON: She's as crazy as the old man! She says this creature is her friend. Well, I've hunted wild beasts and I've seen what they can do! (<i>GASTON whips the VILLAGERS into a frenzy, transforming them into a wild, angry mob.</i>) The Beast will make off with your children. He'll come after them in the night!</p> <p>BELLE: He would never do that!</p> <p>GASTON: Forget the old man! I say... we kill the Beast!</p> <p>VILLAGERS: Kill him!</p> <p>(<i>Beauty and the Beast</i>, 1991, 01.05.47- 01.07.07)</p>	<p>Dialogue 2</p> <p>JUSTIN: We need the ability to fight these scoundrels. Justice is necessary, no matter where we are. In order to destroy evil, you need power. And that power belongs to us! The Beast... The ugly Beast...</p> <p><i>He must be unveiled in order to maintain the integrity of U. Why is it you are always with the Beast?</i></p> <p>BELLE: I'm not.</p> <p>JUSTIN: Tell me where he is right now, or you will face the consequences. This is your last chance to answer me. I will unveil you right here and now if you don't.</p> <p>[ominous music]</p> <p>BELLE: I wouldn't tell you even if I knew.</p> <p>JUSTIN: What?</p> <p>BELLE: You don't care about maintaining justice, you just want to control people. (<i>Belle</i>, 2021, 01.07.47-01-08.35)</p>

Table Dialogue 1 and Dialogue 2

Phenotext elements are when Belle says to Gaston and the villagers that the Beast is not as vicious as they look physically. But Gaston, in his arrogance, said that the Beast is a monster that will endanger the peace of the villagers. Gaston felt his ego disturbed when Belle said that the Beast was not that scary. Genotext element is shown by the utterance of sarcasm when Gaston said, "*She's as crazy as the old man! She says this creature is her friend. Well, I've hunted wild beasts and I've seen what they can do!*" with a sarcastic tone and a medium-high pitch voice. Then in the statement "*The Beast will make off with your children. He'll come after them in the night!*" what Gaston said in an intimidating tone and the intonation of the voice was high enough that it caused villagers to be afraid of the Beast. The utterances shouted by Gaston that would kill the Beast gave the villagers a rush of energy, which was eventually burned to follow Gaston and catch the Beast. Figure 4.25, Gaston makes a body gesture showing that he is the strongest and that his power can drive the villagers' energy to act on what he says. Phenotext elements when Justin tells Belle that for the an ideal existence, the Dragon must be destroyed or "Unveil". It is considered a phenotext, the way Justin talks to Belle (Suzu) with the threat of the consequences Belle will face if she refuses to reveal where Dragon is. the genotext element is when Justin says "*In order to destroy evil, you need power. And that power belongs to us! The Beast... The ugly Beast...He must be unveiled in order to maintain the integrity of U*" which he said with an intonation with emphasis and emotion of anger. Especially when he tightened his hands and expressed his desire to destroy the Dragon. Justin gets angry and threatens Belle (Suzu) with his weapons after Belle (Suzu) points out what she's saying "*..you just need to control people*". Justin's arrogance and authority are revealed indirectly because he exploits his power for the wrong reasons in order to satisfy his ego.

Conclusion

Based on the analysis of Intertextuality as Depicted in *Beauty and the Beast* (1991) by Gary Trousdale and Kirk Wise to Belle (2021) by Mamoru Hosoda, the researcher can make a conclusion. There are three types of intertextuality apparent in *Beauty and the Beast* (1991) by Gray Trousdale and Kirk Wise and Belle

(2021) by Mamoru Hosoda, which are Optional Intertextuality, Obligatory Intertextuality, and Accidental Intertextuality. There are 23 intertextuality data, 15 data are categorized as optional intertextuality, 7 data are categorized as obligatory intertextuality, and 1 data categorized as accidental intertextuality. This indicates that the most common type of intertextuality in the films *Beauty and the Beast* (1991) by Gary Trousdale and Kirk Wise and *Belle* (2021) by Mamoru Hosoda is optional intertextuality.

The second is phenotext and genotext identified in the films *Beauty and the Beast* (1991) by Gary Trousdale and Kirk Wise and *Belle* (2021) by Mamoru Hosoda. Based on the findings of Chapter 4 research, the researcher assumes that phenotext and genotext are present in several characters in both films. Phenotext elements include dialogue, speech, and scenarios used by characters such as Belle, Beast, and Gaston. Meanwhile, genotext elements includes speech intonation and visual expressions that show in multiple characters as psychological reaction modes.

References

- Allen, G. (2000). Intertextuality. In *Intertextuality*.
<https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203131039>
- Alfaro, M. J. M. (1996). *Intertextuality: Origins And Development of The Concept*. *Atlantis*, 18(1/2), 268–285. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/41054827>
- Fatmasari, Y., & Ariyani, L. D. (2022). *The Transformation Of Narrative Structure In “ True Story Gitta Sessa Wanda Cantika ” A Novel By Agnes Danovar And “ Surat Kecil Untuk Tuhan ” A Movie By Harris Nizam A . Introduction*. *Jurnal Dialektika Program Studi Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris*, 9(2), 109–122.
<https://journal.peradaban.ac.id/index.php/jdpbi/article/view/1246/849>
- Fitzsimmons, J. (2013). *Romantic and Contemporary Poetry: Readings*. Retrieved from CQUniversity e-courses, LITR19049-Romantic and Contemporary Poetry <http://moodle.cqu.edu.au>.
- Gary, T., & Wise, K. (Directors). 1991. *Beauty and the Beast* [Motion Picture]. Disney+Hotstar. https://www.hotstar.com/id/movies/beauty-and-the-beast/1260018151?filters=content_type%3Dmovie

Hosoda, M. (Director). 2021. *Belle* [Motion Picture]. Netflix.
<https://www.netflix.com/browse?jbv=81492822>

Kristeva, J. 1986. *Word, Dialogue and the Novel*. In *The Kristeva reader*. In T.Moi (ed). *The Kristeva reader*. New York: Columbia University Press, p. 35-61

Spradley, J. 1980. *Participant Observation*. Holt Rinehart and Winston, New York, NY